

世界一の速報: Hilary Clinton vs. Donald Trump First Debate にみる

両候補の発話の言語分析

田中茂範

ココネ言語教育研究所

本稿は、2016年9月27日の10時（日本時間）から行われたクリントンとトランプによる最初の直接対決（ディベート）の言語分析の速報である。ここで取り上げるテキストは the Washington Post 社提供のトランスクリプトで、二人の候補者の言語的な違いを見るため、それぞれの発話のみをまとめた Clinton データと Trump データを分割して分析を行った。

発話の総語数はクリントンが 6296 語で、異なり語は約 1340 語であった。クリントンの発話機会は 91 回。一方、トランプは 129 回の発話機会をもち、その総語数は 7994 語に及ぶ。異なり語は約 1200 語である。発話文の長さについては、クリントンが平均 16.2 語であるのに対して、トランプは 12.8 語と幾分短い。同じような長さの文でも、全体としては、クリントンの英語は文体的に安定したものとなっているのに対して、トランプの英語は日常言語のカジュアルさを感じさせるものが多い。以下のその一例である。

CLINTON: So I've tried to be very specific about what we can and should do, and I am determined that we're going to get the economy really moving again, building on the progress we've made over the last eight years, but never going back to what got us in trouble in the first place.

TRUMP: Well, for one thing--- and before we start on that, my father gave me a very small loan in 1975, and I built it into a company that's worth many, many billions of dollars, with some of the greatest assets in the world, and I say that only because that's the kind of thinking that our country needs.

次に、代名詞に関連した使い方を見ると、クリントンが we を強調しているのに対して、トランプは you を強調した発話になっている。自己主張を中心にしたクリントンに対して、対決姿勢を鮮明にするトランプの違いが we か you かの違いに表れているように思われる（詳細な内容分析は今後行いたい）。

Clinton

Trump

I	141	221
We	131	117
You	75	198
He	54	---
People	33	32
They	32	64
She	---	33

表1：クリントンとトランプの代名詞の使用の比較

また、一人称で語る場面もトランプの 221 回とクリントンの 141 回の比較からわかるように、トランプが多い。

次の助動詞の使い方であるが、これは両候補の発話態度を読み取る際の重要な指標となる。以下の両者の違いを示す。

	Clinton	Trump
Will	21	32
Can	29	9
Cannot	5	24
May	3	1
Maybe	5	9
Must	1	1
Would	41	21
Wouldn't	1	2
Could	4	14
Might	2	1
Should	15	22
Shouldn't	1	5
Have to	20	12

表2：クリントンとトランプの助動詞の使用における比較

ここでも両者の違いは明らかである。クリントンが可能性を表す can をトランプより多く使い、トランプは意志・推量を表す will をクリントンより多用している。プラスの可能性を強調するクリントンに対して、可能性を打ち消す cannot を 24 回も使うトランプという構図も読み取ることができる。

CLINTON の can の使用例

And so what I believe is the more we **can** do for the middle class, the more we **can** invest in you, your education, your skills, your future, the better we will be off and the better we'll grow.

He said, back in 2006, "Gee, I hope it does collapse, because then I **can** go in and buy some and make some money."

TRUMP の cannot[can't]の使用例

We **cannot** be the policemen of the world.

We **cannot** protect countries all over the world...

But just like she can't bring back jobs, she can't produce.

また、婉曲的な表現に使う過去形についてみると、クリントンが would を好み、トランプは could を好む傾向がみられる。

CLINTON の would の使用

Independent experts have looked at what I've proposed and looked at what Donald's proposed, and basically they've said this, that if his tax plan, which **would** blow up the debt by over \$5 trillion and **would** in some instances disadvantage middle-class families compared to the wealthy, were to go into effect, we **would** lose 3.5 million jobs and maybe have another recession.

TRUMP の could の使用

All of the things that she's talking about **could** have been taken care of during the last 10 years, let's say, while she had great power.

なお、「必要性」を表現する際に、両者とも強制力の強い響きのある must を避け、have to あるいは should を使っている。傾向としては、have to についてはクリントンが、should についてはトランプがより積極的に使用する傾向がみられる。

以下、参考までに have to の使用例をトランプとクリントンの発話から抜粋しておく。

CLINTON: Have to

First, we **have to** build an economy that works for everyone, not just those at the top. 7

We also **have to** make the economy fairer. 12

You have to judge us, who can shoulder the immense, awesome responsibilities of the presidency, who can put into action the plans that will make your life better.	24
Of course, we are 5 percent of the world's population; we have to trade with the other 95 percent.	27
We also have to look at how we help families balance the responsibilities at home and the responsibilities at business.	117
We have to restore trust between communities and the police.	203
We have to work to make sure that our police are using the best training, the best techniques, that they're well prepared to use force only when necessary.	204
But we also have to recognize, in addition to the challenges that we face with policing, there are so many good, brave police officers who equally want reform.	209
So we have to bring communities together in order to begin working on that as a mutual goal.	210
So we have to do two things, as I said.	213
We have to restore trust.	214
We have to work with the police.	215
We have to make sure they respect the communities and the communities respect them.	216
And we have to tackle the plague of gun violence, which is a big contributor to a lot of the problems that we're seeing today.	217
But we do always have to make sure we keep people safe.	221
We have to say -- we have to come forward with a plan that is going to divert people from the criminal justice system, deal with mandatory minimum sentences, which have put too many people away for too long for doing too little.	234
And we're going to have to make it clear that we don't want to use the kinds of tools that we have.	294
But we also have to intensify our air strikes against ISIS and eventually support our Arab and Kurdish partners to be able to actually take out ISIS in Raqqa, end their claim of being a Caliphate. We're making progress.	306
Our military is assisting in Iraq. And we're hoping that within the year we'll be able to push ISIS out of Iraq and then, you know, really squeeze them in Syria. But we have to be cognizant of the fact that they've had foreign fighters coming to volunteer for them, foreign money, foreign weapons, so we have to make this the top priority.	307

TRUMP: have to

But we have to stop our jobs from being stolen from us.	21
--	----

We have to stop our companies from leaving the United States and, with it, firing all of their people.	22
All you have to do is take a look at Carrier air conditioning in Indianapolis. They left ? fired 1,400 people.	23
We have to renegotiate our trade deals, and we have to stop these countries from stealing our companies and our jobs.	33
So we have to do that.	38
We have to renegotiate our trade deals.	39
And once you say you're going to have to tax them coming in, and our politicians never do this, because they have special interests and the special interests want those companies to leave, because in many cases, they own the companies.	69
We have to stop them from leaving.	71
We have to do a much better job at keeping our jobs.	89
And we have to do a much better job at giving companies incentives to build new companies or to expand, because they're not doing it.	90
And all you have to do is look at Michigan and look at Ohio and look at all of these places where so many of their jobs and their companies are just leaving, they're gone.	91

must も双方 1 回ずつ使用しているが、参考のため使用例を示しておく。

CLINTON: And I think probably he's not all that enthusiastic about having the rest of our country see what the real reasons are, because it **must** be something really important, even terrible, that he's trying to hide.

TRUMP: That line's getting a little bit old, I **must** say.

このように、クリントンは「**〜**にちがいない」という意味合いで使い、トランプは「言わせてもらえば」という慣用的な形で使っており、「**〜**しなければならない」は have to で表現する傾向がある。

内容面において一言述べておくと、country という語を両候補とも使っているがトランプが 51 回でクリントンが 16 回となっており、トランプが圧倒的に多く country に言及している。トランプの使い方は以下に示すように、1、2 例を除き、圧倒的に「自国」の意味で使う場合が多い。

TRUMP: Thank you, Lester. Our jobs are fleeing the **country**.

You look at what China is doing to our **country** in terms of making our product.

Because they're using our **country** as a piggy bank to rebuild China, and many other countries are doing the same thing.

TRUMP: Well, for one thing ? and before we start on that ? my father gave me a very small loan in 1975, and I built it into a company that's worth many, many billions of dollars, with some of the greatest assets in the world, and I say that only because that's the kind of thinking that our **country** needs.

Our **country's** in deep trouble.

What's happened to our jobs and our **country** and our economy generally is ? look, we owe \$20 trillion.

And what you do is you say, fine, you want to go to Mexico or some other **country**, good luck.

But if you think you're going to make your air conditioners or your cars or your cookies or whatever you make and bring them into our **country** without a tax, you're wrong.

We invested in a solar company, our **country**.

Our **country** is losing so much in terms of energy, in terms of paying off our debt.

TRUMP: He approved NAFTA, which is the single worst trade deal ever approved in this **country**.

NAFTA is the worst trade deal maybe ever signed anywhere, but certainly ever signed in this **country**.

So what they're doing is they're leaving our **country**, and they're, believe it or not, leaving because taxes are too high and because some of them have lots of money outside of our **country**.

Instead of that, they're leaving our **country** to get their money, because they can't bring their money back into our **country**, because of bureaucratic red tape, because they can't get together.

It's probably \$5 trillion that we can't bring into our **country**, Lester. And with a little leadership, you'd get it in here very quickly, and it could be put to use on the inner cities and lots of other things, and it would be beautiful.

TRUMP: There's nothing crazy about not letting our companies bring their money back into their **country**.

Our **country** is suffering because people like Secretary Clinton have made such bad decisions in terms of our jobs and in terms of what's going on.

But that's the kind of thinking that our **country** needs.

When we have a **country** that's doing so badly, that's being ripped off by every single **country** in the world, it's the kind of thinking that our **country** needs, because everybody ?

Lester, we have a trade deficit with all of the countries that we do business with, of almost \$800 billion a year.

We have a situation in this **country** that has to be taken care of.

And believe me, this **country** thinks it's ? really thinks it's disgraceful, also.

It's because it's about time that this **country** had somebody running it that has an idea about money.

When we have \$20 trillion in debt, and our **country's** a mess, you know, it's one thing to have \$20 trillion in debt and our roads are good and our bridges are good and everything's in great shape, our airports.

Our airports are like from a third world **country**.

You land at LaGuardia, you land at Kennedy, you land at LAX, you land at Newark, and you come in from Dubai and Qatar and you see these incredible ? you come in from China, you see these incredible airports, and you land ? we've become a third world **country**.

Whether it's 6 or 5, but it looks like it's 6, \$6 trillion in the Middle East, we could have rebuilt our **country** twice.

Our **country** has tremendous problems.

And we have a **country** that needs new roads, new tunnels, new bridges, new airports, new schools, new hospitals.

TRUMP: Which our **country** should do, too.

And that's what this **country** should be doing.

And we should be able to do that for our **country**.

If we don't have it, we're not going to have a **country**.

And when I look at what's going on in Charlotte, a city I love, a city where I have investments, when I look at what's going on throughout various parts of our **country**, whether it's? I mean, I can just keep naming them all day long ? we need law and order in our **country**.

Is this a war-torn **country**?

If you look at it, throughout the **country**, there are many places where it's allowed.

TRUMP: Because I want to get on to defeating ISIS, because I want to get on to creating jobs, because I want to get on to having a strong border, because I want to get on to things that are very important to me and that are very important to the **country**.

And I think I did a great job and a great service not only for the **country**, but even for the president, in getting him to produce his birth certificate.

Now, as far as the lawsuit, yes, when I was very young, I went into my father's company, had a real estate company in Brooklyn and Queens, and we, along with many, many other companies throughout the **country** ? it was a federal lawsuit ? were sued.

TRUMP: I do want to say that I was just endorsed ? and more are coming next week ? it will be over 200 admirals, many of them here ? admirals and generals endorsed me to lead this **country**.

So when Secretary Clinton talks about this, I mean, I'll take the admirals and I'll take the generals any day over the political hacks that I see that have led our **country** so brilliantly over the last 10 years with their knowledge.

Now, whether that was Russia, whether that was China, whether it was another **country**, we don't know, because the truth is, under President Obama we've lost control of things that we used to have control over.

We're a **country** that owes \$20 trillion.

It is the single greatest threat that this **country** has.

This is one of the worst deals ever made by any **country** in history.

To be president of this **country**, you need tremendous stamina.

And this **country** can't afford to have another four years of that kind of experience.

おわりに

これは昨日のディベートの言語分析の速報であり、詳細な分析は一切行っていない。形容詞の使い方、鍵となる名詞概念などを明らかにして、見出される言語的な特徴がどういう意味を持つのかは今後の研究に譲りたい。